



Report Identification Number: AL-15-011

Prepared by: Albany Regional Office

Issue Date: 12/24/2015

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:

- A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
- The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
- The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
- The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child’s family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child’s death; whether the child or the child’s family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child’s death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child’s death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child’s household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may **only** be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. **It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child’s siblings or other children in the household.**

OCFS’ review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS’ assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships		
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle
Contacts		
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner
Dr.-Doctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother
CPR-Cardio-pulmonary Resuscitation		
Allegations		
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	MN-Medical Neglect	EdN-Educational Neglect
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Others	
Miscellaneous		
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence
LDSS-Local Department of Social Service	ACS-Administration for Children's Services	NYPD-New York City Police Department
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services		

Case Information



NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

Report Type: Child Deceased
Age: 1 month(s)

Jurisdiction: Clinton
Gender: Female

Date of Death: 05/11/2015
Initial Date OCFS Notified: 05/14/2015

Presenting Information

Mother gave birth to a set of twin girls on 4/11/15. On 4/23/15, the father placed the twins(12 days old) in separate car seats, prior to the children going through a car seat challenge, which determines if a child is capable of sitting without breathing being impaired. This test is administered to all newborn children. Both parents were aware that both girls needed to pass the car seat challenge before being placed in a car seat for transport. Despite this knowledge, father and mother drove both children to the hospital for a car seat challenge while in their car seats. Once inside the hospital, a nurse detected that the subject child was unresponsive and CPR was started. Father and mother's action placed the children at risk. The subject child's breathing was compromised and the child was comatose for approximately 2 weeks and consequently died on 5/11/15.

Executive Summary

This fatality report concerns the death of a female infant, born 4/11/15, that occurred on 5/11/15. The final autopsy report, signed on 7/10/15, indicated the cause of death was cerebral anoxia due to positional/situational asphyxia and the manner of death was accidental (very small infant placed in car seat).

A CPS investigation was initiated on 5/14/15 with a duplicate report received on 5/15/15, alleging inadequate guardianship of infant twins and DOA/fatality of infant death. Clinton County DSS (DSS) contacted local police who were aware of fatality. No prior CPS or DSS history found on family.

The twin girls were born on 4/11/15 and discharged home with parents on 4/12/15. Upon discharge both infants were using car beds for transportation due to concerns regarding their size. On 4/23/15 infants were brought by the father for a car seat challenge appointment to determine if the infants were able to use a regular infant car seat safely. The father reported upon arrival to the medical center, he took the twin infants out of the car beds and secured them in their car seats, and placed the car seats in a double stroller. The medical center's video surveillance corroborated father's timeline and showed father moving the hat of the deceased infant during registration.

After the father checked in, he left the nursery to meet the paternal grandmother by the elevator, upon return infant was being coded. The twin infants were left with hospital staff to begin the car seat challenge test. Medical records indicate that one infant was connected to the monitors by a nurse at which time she noticed the other infant appeared "pale, cold, floppy and with no heart rate or respirations noted." Medical records indicate infant was immediately brought to a radiant warmer where CPR was started and a code was called. The infant was resuscitated, intubated and stabilized and transferred to the University of Vermont Medical Center where she remained on a ventilator until support was withdrawn on May 11, 2015 at 14:30 hours and pronounced dead.

CCDSS gathered information about the circumstances of the infant's death from the parents, mother's mental health provider, hospital records, interviews with hospital staff, police records, and copies of medical records of infants, pediatrician reports and collateral contacts. There was no evidence of any alcohol or drug misuse. Records indicate mother was following all recommended services, father was not receiving services.



The child’s pediatrician was interviewed and reported no prior concerns regarding the parents or the parent’s care of the children. The pediatrician stated the car beds were a local recommendation and although he had discussed the car seat challenge, the family had not been told to not use a car seat. He reported it is not uncommon for parents to switch a baby from the car bed to a car seat in order to bring the child inside the hospital. The pediatrician stated that strapping a child into a car seat too tight would not cause positional asphyxia.

Law enforcement completed its investigation and no criminal charges were filed. The parents were referred to mental health treatment and declined bereavement counseling. Family has community and family supports. Follow up contacts were made by CCDSS and no concerns were found regarding the care of surviving sibling. Sibling passed a car seat challenge and appropriate car seat is being used.

On 7/13/15, CCDSS determined the report dated 5/14/15 and duplicated report dated 5/15/15 to be unsubstantiated against the parents for inadequate guardianship and DOA/fatality on the deceased infant. The same reports were determined to be unfounded against the parents for inadequate guardianship of the surviving infant. Final autopsy report lists manner of death as accidental.

ARO gathered the information for this report from CONNECTIONS, CCDSS records, hospital/medical records, final autopsy report, mental health records, and police report.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:

- **Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:**
 - **Approved Initial Safety Assessment?** Yes
 - **Safety assessment due at the time of determination?** Yes
- **Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate?** Yes

Determination:

- **Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?** Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
- **Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?** Yes

Explain:

Casework activity was commensurate with case circumstances. See above.

Was the decision to close the case appropriate? Yes

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory or regulatory requirements? Yes

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation? Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.

Explain:

The decision to close the investigation was appropriate by Clinton County DSS. The fatality was accidental and no criminal charges were pursued.



Required Actions Related to the Fatality

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities

Incident Information

Date of Death: 05/11/2015

Time of Death: 01:00 PM

Date of fatal incident, if different than date of death: 04/23/2015

Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death: 13:05 PM

Was 911 or local emergency number called? No

Did EMS to respond to the scene? No

At time of incident leading to death, had child used alcohol or drugs? No

Child's activity at time of incident:

- Sleeping
- Working
- Driving / Vehicle occupant
- Playing
- Eating
- Unknown
- Other: In car seat at hospital

Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to death? Yes

Is the caretaker listed in the Household Composition? No

At time of incident supervisor was: Not impaired.

Total number of deaths at incident event:

Children ages 0-18: 1

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Female	1 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	Alleged Perpetrator	Male	31 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	28 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	Alleged Victim	Female	1 Month(s)

LDSS Response



NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

Clinton County immediately responded to child fatality. Past family history was reviewed (none), services researched (none), Connections History completed. Collateral contacts made, source contacted, law enforcement and DA referrals were made. Clinton County contacted OCFS - Albany Regional Office and completed the 24 hour fatality report. Unannounced and announced visits were conducted in the subject's home, remaining child was observed in home.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Accident

Primary Cause of Death: From an injury - external cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)?No

Comments: County followed their approved protocols by contacting law enforcement, OCFS and the DA's office.

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team?No

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
022663 - Deceased Child, Female, 1 Mons	022665 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
022663 - Deceased Child, Female, 1 Mons	022665 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
022663 - Deceased Child, Female, 1 Mons	022666 - Mother, Female, 28 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
022663 - Deceased Child, Female, 1 Mons	022666 - Mother, Female, 28 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
022668 - Sibling, Female, 1 Month(s)	022665 - Father, Male, 31 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
022668 - Sibling, Female, 1 Month(s)	022666 - Mother, Female, 28 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>



NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

When appropriate, children were interviewed?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Contact with source?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Did the investigation adhere to established protocols for a joint investigation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there an adequate safety assessment of impending or immediate danger to surviving siblings/other children in the household named in the report:				
Within 24 hours?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
At 7 days?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
At 30 days?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
---	--------------------------	--------------------------	-------------------------------------	--------------------------

Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment Profile

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to
--	-----	----	-----	-----------



NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

				Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there an adequate assessment of the family's need for services?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Were appropriate/needed services offered in this case	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Placement Activities in Response to the Fatality Investigation

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving siblings/other children in the household be removed and placed in foster care at any time during this fatality investigation?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Were there surviving siblings/other children in the household removed as a result of this fatality report/investigation?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Legal Activity Related to the Fatality

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Needed but not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Economic support	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Funeral arrangements	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Housing assistance	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mental health services	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Foster care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Health care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>



Legal services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family planning	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Homemaking Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Parenting Skills	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Domestic Violence Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Early Intervention	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alcohol/Substance abuse	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Child Care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Intensive case management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family or others as safety resources	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				
Other	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				

Other, specify: County offered support services

Additional information, if necessary:
Grief counseling offered, mother was receiving mental health services, maternal grandmother is support for remaining child.

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? N/A

Explain:
At the request of the parents, the surviving twin was admitted into hospital for observation for 3 days following the death of the sibling. Clinton County DSS conducted a home visit to the surviving twin and followed up with the pediatrician, who reported no concerns regarding the care of the surviving twin.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

Explain:
Services were offered several times by Clinton County, Chaplin of the hospital and hospital staff.

History Prior to the Fatality

Child Information

- Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment? No
- Was there an open CPS case with this child at the time of death? No
- Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death? No
- Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death? No
- Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death? No



Infants Under One Year Old

During pregnancy, mother:

- Had medical complications / infections
- Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs
- Experienced domestic violence
- Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed
- Had heavy alcohol use
- Smoked tobacco
- Used illicit drugs

Infant was born:

- Drug exposed
- With neither of the issues listed noted in case record
- With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no CPS investigative history within three years prior to the fatality.

CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no CPS investigative history more than three years prior to the fatality.

Services Open at the Time of the Fatality

Required Action(s)

Are there Required Actions related to compliance issues for provisions of CPS or Preventive services ?

- Yes
- No

Preventive Services History

There is no record of Preventive Services History provided to the deceased child, the deceased child's siblings, and/or the other children residing in the deceased child's household at the time of the fatality.

Required Action(s)

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issues for provision of Foster Care Services?

- Yes
- No

Foster Care Placement History



There is no record of foster care placement history provided to the deceased child, the deceased child’s siblings, and/or the other children residing in the deceased child’s household at the time of the fatality.

Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

Recommended Action(s)

Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? Yes No

Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? Yes No