

Report Identification Number: SV-14-030

Prepared by: Spring Valley Regional Office

Issue Date: 7/1/2015

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:

- A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
- The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
- The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
- The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may **only** be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. **It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.**

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.

NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

Abbreviations

Relationships		
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle
Contacts		
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner
Dr.-Doctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother
CPR-Cardio-pulmonary Resuscitation		
Allegations		
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	MN-Medical Neglect	EdN-Educational Neglect
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Others	
Miscellaneous		
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence
LDSS-Local Department of Social Service	ACS-Administration for Children's Services	NYPD-New York City Police Department
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services		

Case Information

NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

Report Type: Child Deceased
Age: 8 month(s)

Jurisdiction: Rockland
Gender: Male

Date of Death: 10/16/2014
Initial Date OCFS Notified: 10/20/2014

Presenting Information

The mother, father, the subject child and a 19-year-old, 17-year-old, 14-year-old, 11-year-old, 6-year-old, 4-year-old and 2-year-old sibling all resided together in the family home. The morning of 10/16/14, the mother found the subject child unresponsive and called 911. She tried to resuscitate the child. The role of the father, who was at work at the time and the other children were unknown.

Executive Summary

On 10/16/14, the Rockland County Department of Social Services (RCDSS) received a report of maltreatment/abuse from the State Central Register (SCR), which listed the allegations of DOA/Fatality and Inadequate Guardianship. The report listed the mother as the subject and the father's role as unknown. The report stated that on the morning of 10/16/14, the mother found the child unresponsive and called 911. The report stated that the mother, father, subject child, adult sibling and six surviving siblings, resided in the family home. The 911 Responder, declared the subject child dead at 11:07AM on 10/16/14. The RCDSS caseworker contacted the source then immediately visited the home.

The worker conducted interviews with the mother, father, surviving siblings and a housekeeper who was present at the home on the date of the incident. The mother reported that the child was placed in his crib at around 12:30AM and she did not check on him during the night. The mother said she entered the child's room about 10:30AM the next morning and found the child unresponsive. The RCDSS caseworker did not inquire why such a long period of time had gone by with no one had checking on the subject child and information was not obtained regarding whether it was customary for the child to sleep for such a long period of time. A CPS history check was done on the parents and a check performed on the housekeeper/nanny that was present on the date of the fatality produced no history. The RCDSS caseworker noted that the police did not have a criminal record for the mother and father. No criminal action was taken and the investigation was closed. Due to the family's religious beliefs, an autopsy was not conducted but x-rays and external examination of the body were conducted. Contact was made with the siblings' pediatrician and a release was sent. There is a note in the case record stating that "pediatricians had no concerns." RCDSS unfounded and closed the case on 12/12/14. According to RCDSS, the information gathered did not uncover any credible evidence to support that the mother maltreated the subject child. The child had no evidence of injury to support abuse and the medical examiner's report stated that the manner and cause of death was undetermined.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:

- **Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:**
 - **Approved Initial Safety Assessment?** Yes
 - **Safety assessment due at the time of determination?** Yes
- **Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate?** Yes

Determination:

- Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation? Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
- Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate? Yes

Was the decision to close the case appropriate? Yes

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory or regulatory requirements? Yes

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation? Yes, the case record notes a consultation took place, but no details noted.

Required Actions Related to the Fatality

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities

Incident Information

Date of Death: 10/16/2014

Time of Death: Unknown

County where fatality incident occurred: ROCKLAND

Was 911 or local emergency number called? Yes

Time of Call: Unknown

Did EMS to respond to the scene? Yes

At time of incident leading to death, had child used alcohol or drugs? No

Child's activity at time of incident:

- | | | |
|--|----------------------------------|---|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Sleeping | <input type="checkbox"/> Working | <input type="checkbox"/> Driving / Vehicle occupant |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Playing | <input type="checkbox"/> Eating | <input type="checkbox"/> Unknown |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Other | | |

Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to death? Yes

How long before incident was the child last seen by caretaker? 10 Hours

Is the caretaker listed in the Household Composition? Yes - Caregiver 1

At time of incident supervisor was: Not impaired.

Total number of deaths at incident event:

Children ages 0-18: 1

NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Adult Sibling	No Role	Female	19 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	8 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	No Role	Male	44 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	42 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Male	4 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	17 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	2 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	11 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	14 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	6 Year(s)

LDSS Response

Upon receiving the fatality report, the Rockland County Department of Social Services Caseworker (RCDSS) immediately made a visit to the case address. Brief interviews were conducted with the mother and father as well as the surviving siblings and a housekeeper who was present at the home on the date of the incident. Contact was made with the source and demographic information was obtained from the family.

The caseworker completed a search for prior abuse regarding the family . The RCDSS caseworker noted that the police did not have a criminal record for the mother and father.

Information regarding the morning of the incident was obtained during the interviews. The mother reported that the subject child was placed in his crib at around 12:30AM and she did not check on him during the night. The mother said that she went into the subject child's room around 10:30AM the next morning and found the subject child unresponsive. The RCDSS caseworker did not document as to why such a long period of time had gone by where no one had checked on the subject child and information was not obtained regarding whether it was customary for the subject child to sleep for long periods of time. Due to the family's religious beliefs, no autopsy was conducted. Only an x-ray and external examination was performed which did not reveal any suspicion of maltreatment.

Contact was made with the surviving siblings' pediatrician and a release was sent. There is a note in the case record stating that the "pediatrician had no concerns."

Bereavement services were offered to the family but were refused since the family reported that they would receive services through their synagogue.

No criminal action was taken and the investigation was closed. The case was unfounded and closed. According to the RCDSS caseworker, based on the information gathered, the caseworker was unable to substantiate the allegations against the mother. The medical examiner's report was completed and received on 12/1/14. The manner and cause of death was undetermined.

NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Undetermined

Primary Cause of Death: Undetermined if injury or medical cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? No

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
012481 - Deceased Child, Male, 8 Mons	012482 - Mother, Female, 42 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
012481 - Deceased Child, Male, 8 Mons	012482 - Mother, Female, 42 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Contact with source?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there an adequate safety assessment of impending or immediate danger to surviving siblings/other children in the household named in the report:				
Within 24 hours?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
At 7 days?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
At 30 days?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
---	--------------------------	--------------------------	-------------------------------------	--------------------------

Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment Profile

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Was there an adequate assessment of the family's need for services?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Were appropriate/needed services offered in this case	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Placement Activities in Response to the Fatality Investigation

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving siblings/other children in the household be removed and placed in	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

foster care at any time during this fatality investigation?				
Were there surviving siblings/other children in the household removed as a result of this fatality report/investigation?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Legal Activity Related to the Fatality

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Needed but not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Economic support	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Funeral arrangements	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Housing assistance	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Mental health services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Foster care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Health care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Legal services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family planning	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Homemaking Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Parenting Skills	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Domestic Violence Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Early Intervention	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Alcohol/Substance abuse	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Child Care	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Intensive case management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Family or others as safety resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Additional information, if necessary:
 Bereavement services were offered to the family. Due to their religious beliefs, the family opted to receive these services through their synagogue.

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

Bereavement services were offered to the family but they reported to already be receiving services through their synagogue.
The family also reported that the surviving siblings were receiving services to help cope with the fatality through their school.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

Bereavement services were offered to the family but they reported to already be receiving services through their synagogue.

History Prior to the Fatality

Child Information

Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment?	No
Was there an open CPS case with this child at the time of death?	No
Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death?	No
Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this child's death?	No
Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?	No

Infants Under One Year Old

During pregnancy, mother:

- | | |
|---|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Had medical complications / infections | <input type="checkbox"/> Had heavy alcohol use |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs | <input type="checkbox"/> Smoked tobacco |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Experienced domestic violence | <input type="checkbox"/> Used illicit drugs |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed | |

Infant was born:

- | | |
|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Drug exposed | <input type="checkbox"/> With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> With neither of the issues listed noted in case record | |

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no CPS investigative history within three years prior to the fatality.

CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no prior CPS history for the family.

NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

Known CPS History Outside of NYS

There is no known history outside of NYS.

Services Open at the Time of the Fatality

Required Action(s)

Are there Required Actions related to compliance issues for provisions of CPS or Preventive services ?

Yes No

Preventive Services History

There is no record of Preventive Services History provided to the deceased child, the deceased child's siblings, and/or the other children residing in the deceased child's household at the time of the fatality.

Required Action(s)

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issues for provision of Foster Care Services?

Yes No

Foster Care Placement History

There is no record of foster care placement history provided to the deceased child, the deceased child's siblings, and/or the other children residing in the deceased child's household at the time of the fatality.

Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

Recommended Action(s)

Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? Yes No

Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? Yes No